



**CONFINTEA**  
**HAMBURG**  
**1997**

A series of 29 booklets  
documenting workshops  
held at the Fifth  
International Conference  
on Adult Education

## 1b Cultural citizenship

Cultural citizenship in the 21st century:  
adult learning and indigenous peoples



This publication has been produced by the UNESCO Institute for Education within the context of the follow-up to the Fifth International Conference on Adult Education (CONFINTEA V), held in Hamburg in 1997.

Readers are reminded that the points of view, selection of facts, and the opinions expressed in the booklets are those that were raised by panellists, speakers and participants during the workshop sessions and therefore do not necessarily coincide with official positions of the UNESCO or of the UNESCO Institute for Education Hamburg. The designations employed and the presentation of the material in this publication do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the UNESCO Secretariat concerning the legal status of any country or territory, or its authorities, or concerning the delimitations of the frontiers of any country or territory.

## Theme 1: Adult learning and the challenges of the 21st century

Booklets under this theme:

1a Adult learning, democracy and peace

1b Cultural citizenship in the 21st century:

adult learning and indigenous peoples

1c Minorities and adult learning:

communication among majorities and minorities

UNESCO Institute for Education  
Feldbrunnenstrasse 58  
D-20148 Hamburg  
Germany

Tel.: (+49 40) 44 80 41-0

Fax: (+49 40) 410 77 23

e-mail: [uie@unesco.org](mailto:uie@unesco.org)

homepage: <http://www.education.unesco.org/uie>

ISBN 92 820 10 89-9

Design by Matthew Partridge, Hamburg

Printed by Druckerei Seemann, Hamburg

1999





## Foreword

In July 1997 the Fifth International Conference on Adult Education was held in Hamburg, organised by UNESCO and in particular the UNESCO Institute for Education, the agency's specialist centre on adult learning policy and research. Approximately 1500 delegates attended from all regions of the world, with representatives of 140 member states and some 400 NGOs. In addition to the work of the commissions and plenary which debated the official documents of the Conference **The Hamburg Declaration** and **The Agenda for the Future**, there were 33 workshops organised around the themes and sub-themes of the Conference.

As part of its CONFINTEA follow-up strategy, the UNESCO Institute for Education has produced this series of 29 booklets based on the presentations and discussions held during the Conference. The recordings of all the workshops were transcribed and synthesized over one year, edited, and then formatted and designed. A tremendous amount of work has gone into this process. Linda King, coordinator of the monitoring and information strategy for CONFINTEA, was responsible for overseeing the whole process. Madhu Singh, senior research specialist at UIE, undertook the mammoth task of writing almost all the booklets based on an analysis of the sessions. She was helped in the later stages by Gonzalo Retamal, Uta Papen and Linda King. Christopher McIntosh was technical editor, Matthew Partridge designed the layout and Janna Lowrey was both transcriber and translator.

The booklets are intended to draw out the central issues and concerns of each of the CONFINTEA workshops. They are the memory of an event that marked an important watershed in the field of adult learning. We hope that they will be of use both to those who were able to attend CONFINTEA V and those who were not. We look forward to your comments, feedback and continuing collaboration with the UNESCO Institute for Education.

Paul Bélanger,  
Director, UNESCO Institute for Education, Hamburg  
and Secretary General of CONFINTEA

# Cultural citizenship in the 21st century: adult learning and indigenous peoples

## Introduction

The session on indigenous peoples and adult education at the Fifth International Conference on Adult Learning (CONFINTEA V), held in 1997 in Hamburg, was attended by an estimated 120 people, a third of whom were indigenous representatives. The first part of the session presented the international context and current status of adult education with regard to indigenous peoples. The second part focused on the views and perspectives of indigenous peoples' representatives. Rudolfo Stavenhagen, research professor at the Colegio de Mexico, a leading international expert on human rights in relation to indigenous peoples and member of the Delors Commission on Education for the twenty-first century, presented the keynote at the first session. In the second part of the session, chaired by Jack Beetson, President of the Federation of Independent Aboriginal Education Providers of Australia, the panel included representatives from some of the independent indigenous organisations from around the world: Nora Rameka was present for the Maori Adult Education Association; Carl Christian Olson from Greenland represented the Inuit Circumpolar Conference; Hilda Canari from Peru represented the Andean regional organisation CADEP; Rosalba Jimenez represented the Organización Nacional Indígena de Colombia; and Natalio Hernandez from Mexico, the Vice-Chair of the session, represented the Casa de los Escritores Indígenas.

Representatives of indigenous peoples came together in this workshop to compare the situations in their own countries with regard to human rights and cultural and social identity. There were calls to establish an international framework for indigenous people so that they

are not isolated from the rest of society, and for the international community to recognise that indigenous peoples have special rights and possess a unique store of knowledge which the world needs and must value. There were also calls for the recognition of the minimum international standards applicable to indigenous peoples, laid down in a series of UN documents over the past few years.

Indigenous people in many parts of the world are still struggling for agreements with their governments to be implemented. An important task of the workshop was to present a global adult education programme for indigenous peoples.

## The current situation of indigenous peoples

The 1989 ILO Convention 169 defines indigenous peoples as “peoples in independent countries who are regarded as indigenous on account of their descent from the populations which inhabited the country, or a geographical region to which the country belongs, at the time of conquest or colonisation or the establishment of present state boundaries and who, irrespective of their legal status, retain some or all of their own social, economic, cultural and political institutions” (Article 1(b)).

The ILO Convention makes a distinction between indigenous and tribal peoples. Tribal communities are “peoples in independent countries whose social, cultural and economic conditions distinguish them from other sections of the national community and whose status is regulated wholly or partially by their own customs or traditions or by special laws or regulations” (Article 1(a)).

The distinction between indigenous and tribal peoples is fluid and remains a cultural or linguistic choice for the communities involved. This distinction tends to be blurred in Asia and Africa, while in the Americas, Australia and New Zealand there is a greater tendency to use the term indigenous peoples.

There are some 5000 different indigenous and tribal groups in the world, comprising in total almost 300 million people, living in around 70 countries. Together they account for 4 per cent of the world's population although in some countries they make up the majority, such as Bolivia. In India there are about 400 different indigenous and tribal groups making up a population of 90 million.

Indigenous peoples participate usually in non-industrial modes of production. Many struggle to survive under very poor circumstances compared to the general standards of the societies in which they live. Their health conditions are often deficient, and they generally have significantly lower chances than others in getting a high school education or a decent job. Within indigenous communities the gap between the educated and the illiterate is growing, and there is a marked discrepancy between male and female literacy, owing to the tendency among these communities to favour men over women when it comes to education. Research indicates that poverty and lack of access to basic services including health and education are closely linked to tribal identity.

## Basic changes in thinking with regard to indigenous peoples

In recent years, two basic tendencies in thinking with regard to indigenous peoples have emerged, which can be said to be crucial to adult education policy.

- 1 A change from government-directed and government-generated policies – towards a human rights approach in which indigenous peoples are no longer just the passive objects of governments' policies but are active participants in the struggle for recognition of their own human rights, and in the redefinition of their relationship with the rest of society.
- 2 A change in policy content, from a policy of assimilation to a concept of cultural citizenship.

# Towards a human rights approach: three sources of human rights for indigenous peoples

Three approaches to human rights for indigenous peoples are now being used in order to build up a special framework of indigenous rights within the UN system.

- 1 The concept of universal human rights.
- 2 The system of protection of minorities within existing states.
- 3 The right of peoples to self-determination.

## 1 A universal framework for indigenous peoples

Various UN agreements over the past few decades indicate a collective effort to build up a new structure of human rights within the international community, in which indigenous peoples have a special role to play. The Universal Declaration on Human Rights is one of the basic sources for the rights of indigenous peoples. The idea behind the Declaration is that all human beings, whatever their culture, race, colour, religion, national origin or gender, are inherently endowed with the same essential rights. This document represented a historic breakthrough.

## 2 Protection of minorities in general

However, simply affirming equality before the law has not been sufficient to guarantee the enjoyment of full human rights. Consequently, there are two other developments in the context of international law which have relevance for adult education policy with regard to indigenous peoples. One is the system of protection of minorities and the other is the recognition of the right to self-determination.

The UN General Assembly has been active since 1992 in promoting the rights of persons belonging to ethnic, national, linguistic or religious minorities. Some would argue for the applicability of such an international system of legal rights to indigenous peoples as well.

However, over the past few years, representatives of indigenous peoples through the United Nations and their particular organisations have rejected the idea that indigenous peoples should be put into the same category as ethnic, linguistic or religious minorities. The basic reason is that

indigenous peoples in some countries are not actually minorities but demographic majorities. Moreover, the concept of indigenous peoples has come about as a result of colonisation and conquest, while that of the minority does not necessarily imply historical subordination. Furthermore, in contrast to many minorities, indigenous peoples share common ancestral territory that is ethnically delineated, and which is distinct from the general territory inhabited by the majority of the population.

### 3 Individual human rights and the right to self-determination

Indigenous peoples as such claim the historical right to territory, right to their own government, to existence and survival as well as to land and resources even prior to the rights of states. In short, they claim the right to self-determination, which has become one of the principle human rights that the United Nations has recognised. This is the third source of human rights for indigenous peoples.

But states do not always see it that way. States, for reasons of their own, consider that the right to self-determination applies to states rather than to peoples, and there is a long history of debate as to which communities should enjoy this right.

## Towards collective rights and cultural citizenship

Crucial to adult learning policy with regard to indigenous people is also the focus within the UN legal framework on the notion of collective rights in addition to individual human rights. The UN agreements over previous years clearly recognise the need for collective rights, such as the right to culture, as upheld by UNESCO. In the various conferences organised by UNESCO around this theme, as well as in several UNESCO documents, it has been emphasised that this right means not just the right to culture in general but the right to one's own culture – that is the culture which one identifies with and which is linked to a specific history and territory.

Closely associated with this notion of the right to culture is the idea of “cultural citizenship”. It introduces the notion of collective rights to culture, and in some cases it implies the struggle for the reconstitution of indigenous cultures and communities which have been seriously eroded through conquest, colonisation and assimilation.

The development of democracy in the western world has been a process of progressive acquisition of individual citizenship rights. In the present context, however, indigenous rights are about the consolidation of collective rights of culturally distinct groups within a wider framework of the so-called nation states.

In the context of this new understanding of collective human rights, indigenous peoples are considered to be active subjects in the implementation of their own human rights. Human rights as we understand them today cannot be taken for granted. They must be demanded from governments and from other members of society. The protection of human rights involves making the broader society recognise them in law and in institutions as well as setting up political and social organisations to implement those rights.

## The four pillars of learning with regard to indigenous peoples

Adult learning, conceived in the perspective of lifelong learning, is education that people pursue in many different places and environments – in the workplace, at home, in the community, or in non-formal settings. Education is seen not as a transient phase that prepares one for the rest of life, but as part and parcel of an individual's and a group's constant development and evolution throughout a life cycle. This involves an approach in which people use more and more educational opportunities in order to take more effective control of their lives through the acquisition of skills, from basic skills such as literacy and numeracy, to more complex ones such as data processing.

Yet, adult learning goes much beyond the acquisition of skills and learning abilities. Adult learning inculcates values and attitudes and patterns of behaviour that are relevant and appropriate to the culture of the learner. It also plays a vital role in the creation and consolidation of personal, collective and national identities. All of these aspects of adult learning are crucial for sustainable livelihoods and the development of viable societies.

In dealing with adult learning with regard to indigenous peoples it may be useful to reinterpret the four pillars of lifelong learning for the 21st century – as outlined in the UNESCO report to the Delors Commission – in terms of the human rights situation of indigenous peoples.

Learning to be	=	the right of self-identification and self-definition
Learning to know	=	the right to self-knowledge
Learning to do	=	the right to self-development
Learning to live together	=	the right to self-determination

Learning to be = the right of self-identification and self-definition

Many nation states have had problems coming to terms with the definition of the concept of indigenous people. Nevertheless, it is becoming increasingly clear that there can be no single definition of indigenous peoples, and indigenous populations should have the right to define themselves subjectively as belonging to a particular indigenous community. The UN Working Group on Indigenous Peoples, in consultation with the indigenous peoples of the world, has come to the conclusion that indigenous peoples and tribal communities have the right to self-definition, and the right to refer to themselves as indigenous or tribal.

As the situation stands today, indigenous peoples prefer to describe themselves using tribal or ethnic names, rather than using a blanket term such as "indigenous" (from the Latin *indigenus*), or "autochthonous" (from the Greek *autokhthon*). However, recently some indigenous peoples have come to recognise their identity as such and to see that they share similar situations and problems with other indigenous communities in terms of denial of human rights and the right to cultural identity.

The right to self-definition goes hand in hand with self-identification. It means the right of indigenous peoples' to their own interpretations of their history as well as the right to learn in their own languages.

As indigenous peoples move into the 21st century, adult learning is playing a crucial role in the interpretation of their own history. Young people are learning their own languages and culture. Indigenous organisations and adult education associations are active in helping indigenous peoples to go back to their culture and their languages, despite the

homogenising tendencies of globalisation and economic development. There are calls for indigenous peoples around the world to take a greater control of their education systems including evaluation and monitoring of their own qualification frameworks.

There are programmes for women from indigenous communities to learn their language and history through arts and crafts. There are also programmes for urbanised indigenous persons now returning to rural areas. In some cases it involves a complete reversal of previous government programmes based on the integration of indigenous peoples into modern urbanised culture.

At present, the education system of many indigenous peoples is a hybrid between indigenous and formal western education. But the latter tends to foster imitation rather than promoting indigenous cultural values. Although many indigenous peoples are dynamic and flexible and open to formal education, they nevertheless feel the need to defend their own identity, as they consider it of special significance to their survival. Many consider it necessary to participate in the world community with regard to adult education. One attempt has been to promote cultural integration of indigenous adults in different parts of the world through cultural education. So, although adults are necessarily open to globalisation, there is a demand from the communities themselves to have a strong cultural element in their education.

Learning to know = the right to self-knowledge

The international community must recognise that indigenous peoples not only have special rights but also possess special knowledge which the world needs and must value if it is to survive the next century.

This right to self-knowledge has been denied to them through the official education system generally and through the imposition of foreign values on their societies. Indigenous peoples have their own informal learning systems which are compatible with their livelihood systems. Adult learning is not a new concept for indigenous people but a part and parcel of their life and livelihood.

Therefore, when we talk about "indigenous education", this has to mean something different from "education for indigenous people". The latter is mostly conceived in terms of access and participation in the mainstream education system, which historically has been deeply divi-

sive and exclusionist. Indigenous education which promotes indigenous languages, cultural and religious beliefs and legal systems is often dismissed as primitive and uncivilised, and generally receives inadequate funding.

Recently however, indigenous education and training of indigenous peoples have been particularly stressed in the 1989 ILO Convention 196. Several articles emphasise the need for the peoples' participation in the design of a system appropriate to their needs, traditions and cultures. Sub-paragraph 3 of Article 27, for example, recommends that: "Governments shall recognise the right of these peoples to establish their own educational institutions and facilities, provided that such institutions meet minimum standards established by the competent authority in consultation with these peoples. Appropriate resources shall be provided for this purpose". Article 31 calls for measures to be taken to educate the members of the dominant society, to eliminate prejudice and to provide information on indigenous cultures.

Part IV of the **Draft Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples** focuses exclusively on education and establishes the right of indigenous peoples to create and maintain their own educational systems and institutions while not being denied access to all levels and forms of education. The Draft Declaration is being ratified by the UN General Assembly.

There are however specific policies and strategies needed to ensure respect for indigenous knowledge, in a world increasingly interconnected and economically competitive. In programmes of indigenous education great care must be taken not to perpetuate educational racism in its more subtle forms. An understanding of the distinctive but complementary roles of indigenous and exogenous knowledge can help to build bridges towards a brighter future for humankind in the global society.

Learning to do = the right to self-development

The third pillar of education, learning to do, translates for indigenous peoples as the right to self-development. It implies the idea of the right to develop one's own concepts about development. Very often, development projects or programmes of national bureaucracies as well as of international financial agencies impose their ideas of development on indigenous peoples.

Indigenous concepts of development are inextricably linked to culture, education, environment and self-determination. Sustainable development for indigenous peoples is possible only by protecting indigenous languages and culture.

Many indigenous communities practise a subsistence economy in contrast to a cash economy. This non-industrial mode of production is closely intertwined with cultural survival and education, including education for life skills. Indigenous peoples' rights to subsistence and to retention of their own value system should therefore be included in any discussion of sustainable development and self-development.

Accepting the basic relationship between learning and culture and promotion of the right to self-knowledge, those involved in education should seek to understand and see that indigenous learning is centrally associated with the transmission of the culture of indigenous peoples and to identify local strategies associated with these learning and transmission processes.

## Learning to live together = the right to self-determination

The right to self-determination implies the right to be able to reorganise the relationships between indigenous peoples and the wider society, not on terms defined unilaterally by the dominant society, but on terms defined in consultation with the indigenous peoples. In several societies a process of national cultural cooperation is underway. In Mexico for example this comprises three fundamental objectives:

- 1 A shared commitment to raising the living standards and broadening opportunities for indigenous peoples.
- 2 The acknowledgement of the interrelatedness of various elements of society and the interlocking history of both indigenous and national societies.
- 3 A mutual acceptance of the importance of working together and of respecting and appreciating differences.

In order to make the right to self-determination a reality, it is necessary to establish partnerships among equals rather than treating indigenous peoples as deserving beneficiaries of a one-way education system. In fact, the decade 1995–2004 has been proclaimed as the International Decade of the World's Indigenous People (IYWIP) and the theme of this decade adopted by the UN General Assembly has been appropriately termed "towards a new partnership".

As indigenous people move to the next millennium, their aspirations to partake of the benefits of globalisation, without giving up their identity and dignity, must be respected. For this to happen there is need for a constructive dialogue between cultures.

## Intercultural education: recommendations for follow-up

Adult learning for and by indigenous peoples must be rooted in the **principles of intercultural education**. This calls for a review of contents, a development of a methodology, a promotion of dialogue between educator and learner, and an understanding of the socio-cultural contexts of adults.

On the **methodological level**, it may be necessary to develop new strategies of learning such as “intercultural dialogue” and “constructive confrontation between cultures”. These strategies could be helpful in identifying distinctive types of logic, different visions of the world, and distinctive knowledge and forms of learning. This would enable adults to develop a critical attitude towards their own culture, and help in the selection of cultural contents.

At the **decision-making level**, indigenous peoples must participate at all levels of decision-making – educational, cultural, developmental and political – in order to create within broader societies an awareness of the principles of mutual respect and equality, as well as the right to be culturally different. Concrete proposals should be formulated to favour changes in the attitudes of adults towards culturally mixed populations. Many initiatives could be promoted that support precisely this kind of intercultural dialogue, through courses in indigenous languages, seminars, workshops, conferences and cultural programmes.

While indigenous languages and imparting basic educational competencies in the mother tongue is a key to promoting cultural identity and personal development, it is equally important to promote global languages of communication as well as the national or official languages, so that indigenous peoples have access to the opportunities offered by globalisation.

## Conclusion

The task of adult learning is to raise the quality of life and the possibility for indigenous peoples in recognising this to the fullest, to develop reading and writing skills, promote the participation of indigenous populations in urban and national life, promote the training and specialisation of indigenous peoples in different sectors of work, as well as training them in the administration of enterprises and organisations, and in the development of technologies.

Yet adult learning is more than this; it should be about teaching the values and possibilities of multicultural citizenship as a new way of regulating the relationship between the indigenous peoples and the rest of society.

To sum up the recommendations:

- 1 Basic educational competencies in indigenous languages, but also in the national and global languages of communication, should be a fundamental entitlement.
- 2 Bilingual intercultural education should be included in national adult learning systems.
- 3 In a civil society adult learning empowers all communities including indigenous communities as it enhances chances for participation in society and for economic survival.
- 4 Indigenous peoples should participate in the design of adult learning opportunities and materials. Their ways of learning form an intrinsic part of the programme offered. They should also be involved in monitoring and evaluation. This will help prevent ineffective or inappropriate programmes.
- 5 Curricula should address indigenous peoples' cultural heritage and history.
- 6 Case studies should be undertaken that deal with realities of indigenous peoples.

This document can be freely reproduced. It would be appreciated if a copy of any publication reproducing this text in full or in part could be sent to: Publications Department, UNESCO Institute for Education.



The CONFINTEA logo, designed by Michael Smitheram of Australia, represents the lines on the palm of a hand. These lines are universal and yet different for each subject. They celebrate cultural diversity and the joy of learning.

## Theme 1

### Adult learning and the challenges of the 21st century

Booklets under this theme:

- a Adult learning, democracy and peace
- b Cultural citizenship in the 21st century:  
adult learning and indigenous peoples
- c Minorities and adult learning:  
communication among majorities and minorities