

# EFA Global Monitoring Report – Summary of Consultation 2010

## **Introduction**

This year's consultation concerning the EFA Global Monitoring Report 2010 has drawn comments and contributions in English, French and Spanish from more than 250 participants. It was conducted between 24 February and end-March 2009 with contributors asked to respond to a dedicated email address.

Additional discussions conducted in person or in separate consultation meetings are not included here.

## **Overall findings**

The theme of the 2010 Report is "Reaching and teaching the most marginalized." It will explore the factors that perpetuate marginalization, along with the success or failure of public policy responses. Some contributors took issue with the term marginalization, feeling that "inclusion" or "exclusion" were preferred usage, but nearly everyone saw this theme as a logical and desirable extension of the 2009 Report on inequalities in education. Strong support was expressed for building on this foundation to further understanding of the different dimensions of marginalization, and the distinctive set of challenges for providing all children, youth and adults with equal opportunities for good quality education and development. There was interest in looking more closely at the historical processes affecting marginalization, either in reducing disparities or in undoing existing progress.

Many people indicated which marginalized populations they thought the GMR should focus on, often reflecting their own area of affiliation or research interest. These suggestions fell into clusters: children with disabilities was the largest group - especially the visually impaired – followed by children at risk or living in difficult circumstances (street children, orphans, child laborers, conflict/emergency situations), youth, rural populations (« . . . the majority of the poor and the marginalized, including more than 4 out of 5 out-of-school children, are rural»), the linguistically marginalized, and illiterate adults.

Some readers registered strong concern because it appeared from the Concept Note that Early Childhood Care and Education (ECCE) would not be covered in this year's Report, even though the theme is intended to be inclusive of all EFA goals.

There was broad agreement that conditions of extreme poverty exacerbate the effects of exclusion, resulting in cumulative disadvantage – whatever the particular group - and that both poverty and gender should be treated as cross-cutting themes.

The role of teachers in helping to reach these groups was emphasized, as was the importance of providing teachers with the tools, working conditions, incentives and professional status needed to draw more teachers into the classroom and ensure they receive the support required to develop their skills, provide a quality learning experience and remain committed to teaching.

Finally, many contributors argued for a human rights approach to reaching and teaching the most marginalized, especially for the disabled, while also citing the links between EFA and Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), plus broader issues of economic health and social development. Several standard-setting frameworks were mentioned, including the Declaration of Human Rights, the Declaration on the Rights of the Child, the Salamanca Declaration and Framework of Action on Special Needs Education, and the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities.

A summary of comments and contributions follows, grouped under general headings.

## Conceptual issues, comments and concerns

- We must reach across the aisles to find effective means to reinforce the concept of rights and merge civil, societal, educational, economic and political development processes.
- GMR should improve and expand its definition of marginalization beyond that of being deprived access to education: often this is only a result of social marginalization – marginalization is also a result of power asymmetries more broadly.
- Try grouping according to various dimensions of Human Rights:
  - cultural: ethnic minorities, language
  - social: street children, HIV/AIDS affected, special needs
  - political: no voice
  - economic: poverty
- Change the « medical and individual framing of disability » used in the Concept Note. Disability, like gender, is a social construct based on discrimination, and it should be considered as such throughout the GMR. The medical model views the cause of exclusion as the individual's impairment, whereas the social model focuses on the environmental, social and institutional barriers that disable individuals and restrict their participation.
- Teachers are not receiving adequate attention and the Concept Note suggests GMR 2010 will only treat the teaching of marginalized groups. While this is important, quality education is necessary for all children, including marginalized groups.
- Data from household surveys using conventional methods will not cover the vast majority of marginalized people – what to do?
- Financing: GMR is focusing too much on the need for additional external funding, which in the long run and in view of the financial crisis will make countries more dependent and not be sustainable.
- Make more effort to collect information from the huge network of NGO and civil society organizations with experience on the ground, especially in NFE and literacy and adult education.
- INEE Minimum Standards should be highlighted as they represent a good practice framework and one of the few existing tools that provide concrete strategies to overcome extreme marginalization in the education sector and support quality public policies on this issue.
- GMR has neglected the potential of open and distance learning to reach the hard-to-reach and children in emergency situations.
- GMR should pay closer attention to role of universities and tertiary institutions in supplying and training qualified teachers.
- The 15 countries mentioned in the Concept Note do not seem to give priority to those countries that are farthest from the EFA Goals with targets.
- Language issues must be placed at the centre of EFA. For marginalized learners, the school language creates huge barriers to learning, compounding other challenges such as poverty, remote locations, migration, hunger, conflict and labour issues.
- The importance of initial literacy in mother tongue and multi-lingual education in general should also be thoroughly explored . . . such programmes lead to higher enrollments, lower drop-out rates and higher achievement. They also combat social exclusion.
- Serious international action and investment must be focused on teaching training in multilingual approaches, producing materials in local languages, and altering assessment systems.
- Important to show the connection between education of adults and attaining the other EFA and MDG goals. Adult education has been neglected within the EFA framework, even though 3 of its 6 goals refer to it.
- GMR figures on literacy indicate that countries farthest from the EFA goals are usually those with lowest literacy rates, suggesting that literacy should be a higher priority, especially for women.

- GMR has made only token references to children with disabilities in earlier EFA/GMR reports and this should not be repeated in the 2010 report which provides the perfect opportunity to address the marginalization of these children and their families.
- Why is there no mention of the role early childhood care and development (ECCD) plays in causing, and mitigating, marginalization?
- GMR should consider the important issue of ECCD and Emergencies: ECCD programmes can fill the gaps of family and social order torn apart by conflict and disasters. They also afford a window of opportunity to engage with national and civil institutions to strengthen local capacity in the transition and post-transition phases.
- UNESCO is supposed to be a flagship for inclusive education.
- The GMR should take a serious look at the potential of Open Schooling, because 'more of the same' is not going to address the challenges facing the marginalized.

### **Suggested resources and examples of projects and approaches**

#### **POLICY, ANALYSIS, FINANCE**

- GTZ Non-formal education synopses of 3 African countries
- OSI's Education Support Programme: studies on the privatisation and the political economy of education
- GRETA analysis available on EFA illiteracy rates, out-of-school children and groups deprived of education for countries in sub-Saharan Africa
- UNESCO-IIEP data base on country education plans – especially Latin America
- UNAIDS: case studies and figures from different regions on education policy, teaching and learning processes, costs of reaching and teaching, training
- India's 2004 Supreme Court order giving cooks from the lowest castes and tribes priority in serving mid-day school meals
- Afghanistan: Fall of the Taliban from power (2000) contributed to 500% increase in school enrolment
- Pakistan: Rise of Taliban (2008-2009) in Swat Valley has led to burning of girls' schools

#### **ICTS, OPEN AND DISTANCE LEARNING**

- CDEC and UNICEF field reports on open and distance learning to reach hard-to- reach children and children in emergencies, including:
  - Sri Lanka: Kothmale Community Radio Internet Project for students and teachers.
  - Brazil: TV Plus, broadcasting and print materials
  - Venezuela: Radio Mathematics
  - Zambia: Radio Maths and Language
  - India: BRAC programme for reaching street children and BRAC Adolescent Primary Schools for over-age primary children (aged 11-14)
  - Colombia: Escuela Nuova
- Hidden privatisation in public education
- Education International's Africa study

#### **MOTHER LANGUAGE, BILINGUAL EDUCATION, LITERACY**

- Burundi: case study of the Batwa people (440,000)
- Language and mother tongue education: SIL examples from DR Congo, Togo, West Asia, Mexico, Thailand, Peru, Benin, Chad, Papua New Guinea, Indonesia, Vietnam
- Association for the Development of Education in Africa (ADEA)
- Mali: a study of literacy practices among graduates of a bilingual school
- Indonesia: evaluation of multilingual approaches to literacy (UNLD)
- South & Southwest Asia: multilingual approaches and case studies (UNLD)

- Literacy policies in urban contexts: South Africa, the Philippines, Brazil
- Literacy teaching and practice in urban contexts: Namibia, Botswana, Nigeria
- Female literacy learners in Oman (UNLD)
- Brazil: AlfaSol projects on literacy and Youth and Adult Education
- Braille in India: study of braille as a tool to promote early Braille writing skills and literacy acquisition as the same age as sighted peers.

#### EMERGENCIES

- INEE (InterAgency Network for Education in Emergencies) Minimum Standards for Education in Emergencies, Chronic Crises and Early Reconstruction encompassing access and learning, teaching and learning (curricula guidance), participation, teacher training, policy formulation
- UNESCO Guidebook for planning education in emergencies and reconstruction

#### YOUTH

- European Youth Forum: reports on Non-formal education activities and efforts to reduce exclusion including Romania, Roma Youth, Scouts, Student Unions, Lithuania, Don Bosco, the French « banlieues » (suburbs).
- Trinidad & Tobago: The SERVOL project brings together parents and communities in a partnership with government to improve ECCE and skills training for youth.
- Mali: Association Karamba Toure (Swiss Cooperation) uses learning kits with materials related to daily life (water, crops, health, natural resources) to reach out-of-school young people
- Sweden's « folkbildningsradet » (folk high schools), that provide alternative education for immigrants, described by the Swedish National Council of Adult Education.

#### INCLUSIVE EDUCATION AND CHILDREN WITH SPECIAL NEEDS

- All India Confederation of the Blind (AICB): a study showing the gap between the Indian government's programme for Education of Children with Special Needs and the reality on the ground.
- Tajikistan: non-formal education (GTZ)
- Armenia: Inclusive Education (GTZ)
- Kenya and Ghana: inclusive education (GTZ)
- Gender-friendly school environments
- China: a partnership for educating children with visual impairment (Perkins)
- Philippines: Empowering Communities in the Education of Children with Visual Impairment
- Braille in India: study of Braille as a tool to promote early Braille writing skills and literacy acquisition as the same age as sighted peers
- Aide et Action's study on the importance of educating the family first in combating marginalization of handicapped children at home
- Ecuador: Study of a national initiative to advance the special education services (Perkins)
- India: the Voice and Vision project to improve teaching skills of those who work with the blind or deaf (Perkins)
- Ecuador's Escuela Especial para Ciegos Julius Doepfner in ciudad Ambato (facilities for the deaf and the blind)
- Italy: Describes Italian legislation and provision for blind or partially sighted children (World Blind Union)
- Mexico: about the Asociacion Mexicana de educadores de Personas con Discapacidad Visual
- UNICEF report (Innocenti Digest No. 13) documenting a wealth of experiences in promoting inclusion in Angola, UK, Mexico, Philippines, Bulgaria, Uganda, Lesotho, Nicaragua, Maldives

- Missing Millions (World Vision): examines African national plans and whether or not they provide for disabled children
- Disability, education and healthcare for children with disabilities: from policy to implementation (African Decade for handicapped persons) – measures gap between policy and reality
- Cameroun: Policy recommendation by the Association d'Aide a l'Education de l'Enfant Handicape (AEEH)
- Cyprus: Articles from European Journal of Special Needs Education and the European Journal of Psychology on Marginalization in primary schools: listening to children's voices
- Consultative Group on Early Childhood Care and Development: cross-disciplinary case studies with input from UNESCO and other members of CG

#### TEACHERS, TEACHING, CURRICULUM

- Bhutan: Continuous Formative Assessment (CFA) as a way to improve teaching and learning
- INEE Guidance notes on teacher compensation in Fragile States, Situations of Displacement and Post-Crisis Recovery
- Tchad: experience creating « ecoles communautaires » in remote rural areas using « neophyte teachers » to improve literacy and provide role models for girls (Swiss cooperation)
- Nigeria: reviews policies and programmes for reaching the girl-child (Institute of Education, Obafemi Awolowo University)
- IBE-GTZ study on relevance of curricula in 10 African countries
- Mali: Institut pour l'Education populaire de Kati (Swiss Cooperation): trains teachers in active methods that impart values of equity and empowerment, and mobilise communities
- Mali: (Delta Survie): pilot project for mobile schools to serve Bozo fishers, Peult and Touareg nomads in the Mopti Region by adopting a relevant curriculum, improving quality, providing school canteens and literacy training for adults
- Mali: Association Karama Toure (Swiss Cooperation) – uses science learning kits (« malles ») to reach children, youth and adults with relevant materials, and to engage the local community
- UNESCO materials on ECCE teachers
- Kenya: CIDA suggests to look within SWAp programme-based approaches) for examples from Kenya education sector support program (KESSP)
- Tanzania: CIDA suggests to look at Tanzania education sector development program (ESDP)
- ADEA's biennale report on « Reaching Out, Reaching All » and « The Challenge of Learning in sub-Saharan Africa » suggested by CIDA
- Mali and Benin: Planete Urgence's « Ecole Mobile de Brousse »
- *Prospects Quarterly Review of Comparative Education*, special issue (February 2008) on theme of marginalization, with review article on Making Education for All inclusive: where next?
- UNAIDS: case studies and figures from different regions on education policy, teaching and learning processes, costs of reaching and teaching, training.

#### CHILDREN AT RISK – ORPHANS, CHILD LABORERS, STREET CHILDREN

- M.V. foundations and Alliance2015's Stop Child Labour Africa Tour Report 2008: field visits to Morocco, Ethiopia, Zimbabwe, Uganda, Kenya. Earlier reports cover India, Albania, Nepal, Central America (Honduras, Guatemala, Costa Rica, Nicaragua)
- Egypt's Friendly One-classroom Schools for Children Living in Difficult Circumstances (UNESCO Beirut)

- Senegal: The Collectif Education Alternative (CEA), regrouping 52 associated schools, that works to improve the conditions of street children (talibe), child labourers, handicapped youth and adults in city slums – (also mentioned in studies by World Bank, UNICEF, USAID etc)
- Ethiopia: World Learning views and resources on Increasing Access to Education for Orphans and Vulnerable Children
- Madagascar (see Aide et Action)
- Niger: UNESCO information on holistic education programme of women's group in rural Niger
- Burundi: Since 2000, UNESCO programme on education of street children involving 2000 children
- Guatemala: Centre educatif « Solo Para Mujeres » to fight prostitution, substance abuse, sexual abuse (UNESCO Newsletter)
- Education of Roma Children (UNESCO/Council of Europe)
- Street children and HIV & AIDS (UNESCO 2006)
- UNESCO examples of projects for street children in Indonesia, Bolivia, Argentina, Guatemala, Egypt, Mali, Honduras
- Madagascar: Planete Urgence project for street children in Antananarivo
- ATD Quart Monde: Stories about how poverty can separate parents from their children: Burkina Faso, Guatemala, Haiti, Philippines, United Kingdom, United States

## Conclusion

Unlike earlier years when the GMR team conducted interactive web consultations involving a moderator and invitations to comment on different contributions or points of view, this year's Consultation2010 relied on email communications only. Although there may have been less discussion, the contributions have been well targeted in identifying a wide range of specific projects and activities in countries around the world that illustrate good practice and creative approaches to reaching and teaching the marginalized.

The GMR team would like to thank everyone who has responded to its invitation to contribute ideas and materials to the 2010 EFA Global Monitoring Report.

UNESCO, Paris  
May 2009