

General Terms of Reference

UNESCO Call for proposals: Defining Internet Universality Indicators

Overarching objective of the project

Following UNESCO's adoption of the CONNECTing the Dots Outcome document in 2015 as its new approach to Internet issues as well as the successful development and application of the IPDC Media Development Indicators, UNESCO is pleased to launch a new project: "Defining Internet Universality Indicators". This project aims to elaborate appropriate Internet indicators which can enrich stakeholders' capacity to assess Internet development, broaden international consensus and foster online democracy and human rights towards knowledge societies engaged in sustainable development. This study will be founded on the UNESCO concept of Internet Universality as the guiding framework which promotes an Internet based on human Rights, and the principles of Openness, Accessibility and Multi-stakeholder participation (abbreviated as the R.O.A.M principles).

This new project responds to the expectations of UNESCO Member States and other stakeholders for continued work in developing and strengthening indicators to further understand media landscapes and communication ecosystems, including the Internet. The application of such indicators can provide stakeholders with credible and comprehensive information about key performance on Internet development and with recommendations on policy improvements.

The successful development and application of the UNESCO IPDC Media Development Indicators has helped stakeholders to introduce reforms aimed at enhancing how a healthy media ecosystem could contribute to democracy, human rights and development. The Internet is still an emerging field of study, and to date no authoritative indicators exist which would highlight the areas of mandate of UNESCO and which are cumulatively essential for building knowledge societies as the foundations of sustainable development.

The project strategically contributes to reinforcing priority program areas of UNESCO's mandate to promote freedom of expression on all platforms and universal access to information and knowledge. Therefore, it aims at enriching UNESCO's contribution to global Internet governance as well as allowing the Organization to work effectively on all regions (including attention UNESCO's priority given to Africa) and contribute to advancing gender equality and children/youth empowerment.

The ultimate results of this new research will be a recognised and authoritative global research tool for assessing Internet development in each country, with a view to assessing policy developments so that a R.O.A.M.-based Internet can make an optimum contribution to the 2030 Agenda of Sustainable Development Goals.

General Terms of Reference: Defining Internet Universality Indicators

Terms of Reference of the Deliverable: Develop and finalize an elaborated set of Internet Universality Indicators through a global multi-stakeholder consultation online and offline.

Objectives	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. To develop and finalize an elaborated draft set of Internet Universality indicators and sub-indicators, means of verification and data sources, in line with international human rights standards and within the focus of the Internet Universality concept, with realistic and practical applicability to countries at all levels of statistical development. 2. To plan and conduct an inclusive global and regional consultation process with multi-stakeholder groups as part of the key research methodology, which will feed into the drafting and elaboration of Internet Universality indicators. This will include offline consultations, as well as via the construction and use of a dedicated online platform/website with multi-lingual access.
Deliverable	<p>The final deliverable setting out the indicators will take the form of a policy paper in English with maximum 100 standard pages (minimum of 320 words each) excluding annexes and bibliography, as well as an online platform/website on Internet Universality indicators under the UNESCO domain name and server.</p> <p>A draft of the deliverable will be presented on the project's online platform/website (to be created under this project for consultation) and the final version will likely be released as a UNESCO publication. If the budget allows it, the publication will be translated into 4-6 UN official languages, which will assist UNESCO's 195 Member States and other international policy-makers in research that can enrich internet-related policy making.</p> <p>The online platform / website of the project will preferably be in 4-6 UN official languages (including English, French, Spanish, Arabic, Russian and Chinese), with the necessary function to showcase the project and launch online questionnaires and consultations.</p> <p>The online platform/website will be hosted under the UNESCO URL: http://www.unesco.org/new/en/internetuniversality.</p>
Time line	<p>The first draft of elaborated indicators is to be submitted by October 2017 and the final by April 2018.</p>

General Terms of Reference: Defining Internet Universality Indicators

	<p>The project website should be created and put online by June 2017 and used for online consultation and promotion of the Internet indicators by April 2018. The website will remain functional under UNESCO's maintenance subsequent to the completion of the project.</p>
<p>Team requirements</p>	<p>The team in charge of this task shall be composed of experts who collectively represent the necessary expertise on Internet Universality dimensions (human rights, openness, accessibility, multi-stakeholder) as well as good knowledge of gender and children/youth issues.</p> <p>The team should design and implement a detailed plan of multi-stakeholder consultations covering all regions and through the online platform.</p> <p>The team should have, or be able to secure, the necessary technical capacity to manage delivering the project website as part of the consultation process.</p>
<p>Methodology requirements</p>	<p>The consultancy contracted to develop UNESCO's Internet Universality indicators will need:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - To identify a realistic number of key indicators that are relevant to UNESCO's priorities and the ROAM framework, and ensure that the indicators can apply to all countries including those in Africa; - To draw from earlier UNESCO-commissioned work in mapping and analysing the main existing initiatives related to indicators of Internet development; - To propose and conduct a global multi-stakeholder consultation on- and offline in collaboration with UNESCO, and take stock of potentially massive inputs in developing the indicators, means of verification and data sources; - To incorporate credible and multiple sources and data available into the development of the indicators, and to propose alternative methods to generate data where sources do not exist, so that the indicators when finalised and applied in research can cover a range of countries bearing in mind different languages, regions and availability of data; - To take a two-pronged approach to promoting gender equality through both gender mainstreaming and gender-specific activities. The development of indicators will therefore need to explore specific indicators that recognise discriminatory policies and practices that affect women and the Internet. The work will also seek to identify gender disaggregation in indicators as regards to the four categories of rights, openness, accessibility and multi-

General Terms of Reference: Defining Internet Universality Indicators

	<p>stakeholder’s participation. The same imperatives apply to the issues of children/youth;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - To combine both quantitative and qualitative research in developing the deliverable and to ensure that this is contextualised and not inappropriately generalised. This includes avoiding the use of too limited a sample of data that would undermine the universality of the indicators; - To use local researchers where relevant in developing the indicators; - To be able to conduct a pre-test of the indicators; - To advise on eventual piloting of the indicators in three countries.
<p>Criteria of the multi-stakeholder consultation plan</p>	<p>This project will involve a multi-stakeholder approach as advocated by the Internet Universality R.O.A.M. principles. By multi-stakeholder, UNESCO means that key stakeholders should be consulted (including governments, intergovernmental organisations, civil society, academia, the private sector Internet companies, the media (including digital media), and the technical community).</p>
<p>Structure and content of Indicators</p>	<p>The final deliverable shall be organized and drafted according to the following outline:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Introduction of the study and the guiding framework of Internet Universality (5 pages) 2. Methodology used for developing Internet Universality indicators including the description of multi-stakeholder consultation process and synthesis of inputs (10 pages) 3. Literature review including mapping of existing related indicators and analysis (10 pages) 4. A detailed description of the Indicators and their means of verification, following the categories of the R.O.A.M. Model (75 pages): <p>This part develops and elaborates four major categories of indicators along the Internet Universality framework that can be used to analyse the Internet development of a country. A fifth category should consider how a country is balancing the four categories.</p> <p>Each category can be broken down into a number of component issues and/or sub-indexes to be identified by the submitters, which in turn contain means of verification and data sources.</p>

The result should be a research tool that when applied can help stakeholders assess the state of the Internet development and related policy-making in a given country.

It is important to note that UNESCO has conducted a preliminary research on the Internet indicators which should be considered as a basis to draw from in terms of developing the deliverable. This initial background paper will be provided to interested submitters upon request via this email address: internetstudy@unesco.org

Category 1: Human Rights-based indicators:

Human rights based dimension of Internet Universality should assess the extent to which Internet governance in a given country respects and enables the freedom to exercise human rights.

Of particular significance to the Internet as a communications medium are the right to freedom of expression and right to privacy. For UNESCO, freedom of expression is broadly understood and includes (a) the right to impart information (seen especially in the right to press freedom, media freedom, protecting the safety of journalists); (b) the right to seek and receive (seen especially in the right of access to information, or “right to information”). Freedom of expression also encompasses artistic freedom of expression.

Following its new ROAM approach to Internet related issues, UNESCO has a new mandate to protect the right to privacy in the digital age, which refers to a protected sphere for development of the personality and control of personal information. UNESCO is also concerned with rights to cultural participation, gender equality, association, security of the person, and education.

This dimension of the indicators should also address the interdependencies and inter-relationships between these different human rights related to the Internet, and the extent to which a society’s balancing between rights maintains the essence of any right that is limited in the interests of other rights.

Category 2: Openness indicators

Openness dimension of Internet Universality recognizes the importance of technological issues such as open standards, as

well as standards of open access to knowledge and information. Openness also signals the importance of ease of entry of actors into Internet activities and extent of closure that might otherwise be imposed through monopolies.

The indicators of Openness should cover issues such as open standards, open source software, the inter-operability of devices, open data, and open educational resources as well as open application interfaces that ensure that the Internet can remain an open environment. This dimension will also assess the ease of entry to the Internet market as well as the way in which a country primarily experiences the benefit of the Internet as a global rather than nationally fragmented platform. There should also be indicators to assess how national sovereignty issues are balanced with cross-jurisdictional matters on the Internet.

Category 3: Accessibility indicators

Accessible to All for “Internet Universality” raises issues of technical access and availability, as well as digital divides based on economic income and urban-rural inequalities. At the same time, “accessibility” requires engaging with social exclusions from the Internet based on factors such as literacy, language, class, gender, age and disability. UNESCO also considers that indicators assessing the sustainability and reliability of business models, able to finance universal access and provide a diverse range of content and services. Further, understanding that people access the Internet as producers of content, code and applications, and not just as consumers of information and services, the issue of user competencies such as Media and Information Literacy is part of the accessibility dimension of “Universality”. Finally, UNESCO sees this category of access indicators as requiring an assessment of users’ trust in a secure Internet environment.

Accessibility indicators will embrace all these issues and assess the universal access for users, social exclusions from the Internet, sustainability of Internet content and services, as well as the extent of users’ competencies that affects their use of the Internet.

Category 4: Multi-stakeholder indicators

The **Multi-stakeholder** engagement dimension of “Internet Universality” facilitates sense-making of the roles that different stakeholders (representing different sectors as well as different social and economic status, and not excluding women and girls) play in developing and governing the Internet at a range of levels in a given country’s policy development regarding Internet-related issues.

Multi-stakeholder indicators will seek to reflect the reality that the Internet is a complex and multifaceted facility that all users can take part in, and therefore one in which there is a need for many voices to shape policies, even where there are different roles and responsibilities for implementation and evaluation. The indicators here should assess representativeness and quality of participation, and the mix of state-based regulation or co-regulation, corporate self-regulation, institution-based internal regulation, and individual self-regulation. The indicators should also assess the extent to which multi-stakeholder participation characterises the realms of rights, openness and accessibility, and vice versa.

Category 5: Cross-cutting indicators

The four pillar principles of R.O.A.M are distinct, but they also crosscut and reinforce each other. Rights without accessibility would be limited to the few; accessibility without rights would stunt the potential of access. Openness allows for sharing and innovation, and it complements respect for rights and accessibility. Multi-stakeholder participation helps guarantee the other three norms.

As discussed in previous UNESCO reports, any Internet policy or practice exists within a broad ecology of policy choices which in one area can have multiple and unanticipated implications. Having considered these complexities and unanticipated outcomes, it is therefore envisaged to have a fifth category of indicators which crosscut assess more than one dimensions of R.O.A.M. For example, a possible indicator on net neutrality which can affect dimensions of accessibility, openness and rights online very differently. At the same time, it is important to be able to

General Terms of Reference: Defining Internet Universality Indicators

	<p>assess how performance in one category impacts on the other categories.</p> <p>Cross-cutting indicators will thus examine those crosscutting areas and the extent to which a society is able to integrate all four dimensions of Internet Universality, the extent to which policy in one dimension complements or runs contrary to policy in another.</p>
The creation of a Multi-stakeholder Advisory Board	<p>To reinforce the quality, legitimacy and transparency of the project, UNESCO will create a Multi-stakeholder Advisory Board consisting of volunteer experts to help guide the scientific and administrative development of the project. The Board will provide advice, comment and review as required at different stages of the project.</p> <p>The board will be comprised of leading experts from various stakeholders including governments, academic, technical community, private sector, journalists and media organizations, civil society, individual Internet users, UN agencies and intergovernmental groups. The Board will have geographical and gender balance and particularly include experts in gender and children/youth issues.</p>