Ethics Education Programme

Division of Ethics of Science and Technology
standard-setting actions

1997

2003

2005

2007: 10 yrs celebration
Universal Declaration on Bioethics and Human Rights

Preambule

General provisions

Aims
　Scope

Principles

Application of the principles

Promotion of the declaration

Final provisions

1. Human dignity and human rights
2. Benefit and harm
3. Autonomy and individual responsibility
4. Consent
5. Persons without the capacity to consent
6. Respect for human vulnerability and personal integrity
7. Privacy and confidentiality
8. Equality, justice and equity
9. Non-discrimination and non-stigmatization
10. Respect for cultural diversity and pluralism
11. Solidarity and cooperation
12. Social responsibility and health
13. Sharing of benefits
14. Protecting future generations
15. Protection of the environment, the biosphere and biodiversity
Universal Declaration on Bioethics and Human Rights

Application of the principles

Art. 18: Decision-making and addressing bioethical issues
- transparency in decision-making
- dialogue and informed public debate

Art. 19: Ethics committees

Promotion of the Declaration

Art. 22: Role of States
- take all appropriate measures
- encourage establishment of ethics committees

Art. 23: Bioethics education, training and information

Art. 24: Internation cooperation

Art. 25: Follow-up-action by UNESCO
World Commission on the Ethics of Scientific Knowledge and Technology (COMEST)

Report of working group

December 2003

Recommendations for building up worldwide competence in the ethics of science
Theoretical basis of activities

Ethics infrastructure

- Global Ethics Observatory (GEObs)
- **Ethics Education Program (EEP)**
- Assisting Bioethics Committees (ABC)

capacity building

bioethics  science ethics  environmental ethics  technology ethics

Theoretical basis of activities
Global Ethics Observatory

- Database 1: experts (*Who is who in ethics?*)
- Database 2: institutions, organisations, commissions
- **Database 3: ethics teaching programmes**
- Database 4: ethics related legislation and guidelines

- Worldwide coverage
- Freely accessible
- 6 languages: Arabic, Chinese, English, French, Russian, Spanish

Launch: 15 December 2005

www.unesco.org/shs/ethics/geobs

capacity building
Ethics Education Programme

Activities undertaken

1. mapping of experts in ethics
2. sampling of teaching programs
3. advisory ethics committee: core curriculum
4. teacher training course
5. educational resources

capacity building
1. Identifying experts

2. Sampling of programmes

Step 1: Description of programs

- General information
- responsible teacher
- teaching team
- details about the course: language; students
- place in the program
- objectives
- syllabus
- teaching methodology
- study materials
- evaluation: of students; of courses

Five type of forms:
- graduation program
- master program
- PhD program
- specialization program
- continuous education
October 2004: Budapest
(Poland, Czech Rep., Slovak Rep., Hungary, Slovenia)

January 2005: Moscow
Russian Fed., Belarus, Ukraine, Georgia, Armenia, Lithuania, Latvia

November 2005: Split
Croatia, Bosnia-Hercegovina., Serbia-Montenegro, Moldova, Albania, Romania, Bulgaria

November 2006: Muscat
Egypt, Jordan, Kuwait, Oman, Qatar, Saudi Arabia, UAE

March 2007: Istanbul
Cyprus, Georgia, Greece, FYROM, Malta, Turkey,

Step 2: Analysis and comparison of programs
57 forms
56 forms
49 forms
15 forms

Step 3: Validate and input forms in GEObs – database 3
50 forms
There are currently 50 teaching programmes registered in the database.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Select a country:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Region</td>
<td>Select a region:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name of Teacher</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Faculty/Department/School</td>
<td>Select a faculty:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entry Requirements for Students/Academic Background of Students</td>
<td>Select a requirement:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level of University Teaching</td>
<td>Select a level:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Course Language</td>
<td>Select a language:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of Students Enrolled</td>
<td>Select a number range:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Number of Teaching Hours</td>
<td>Select a number range:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Number of Student Working Hours</td>
<td>Select a number range:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Status of the Program</td>
<td>Select a status:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objectives of the Program</td>
<td>Select an objective:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mandatory Study Materials</td>
<td>Any</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 July 2007: 109 programs
## Database 3: Ethics Teaching Programmes

### Search Results Page

#### Global Ethics Observatory (GEO)

Find a teaching program related to ethics

### Database 3: Ethics Teaching Programmes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title of Course</th>
<th>University</th>
<th>Faculty</th>
<th>Level of University Teaching</th>
<th>Area of Ethics</th>
<th>Country</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>View Bioethics</td>
<td>Kaunas University of Medicine</td>
<td>Other</td>
<td>Doctorate/PhD program</td>
<td>Bioethics</td>
<td>Lithuania</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>View Bioethics</td>
<td>Medical University of Lodz</td>
<td>Health sciences</td>
<td>Master program</td>
<td>Bioethics</td>
<td>Poland</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>View Bioethics</td>
<td>University of Szeged</td>
<td>Medicine</td>
<td>Graduation program</td>
<td>Bioethics</td>
<td>Hungary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>View Bioethics</td>
<td>University of Szeged</td>
<td>Medicine</td>
<td>Master program</td>
<td>Bioethics</td>
<td>Hungary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>View Bioethics models in social work</td>
<td>Academy of Labour and Social Relation</td>
<td>Management</td>
<td>Specialization program</td>
<td>Bioethics</td>
<td>Ukraine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>View Biomedical Ethics</td>
<td>Mykolas Romeris University</td>
<td>Public Administration</td>
<td>Master program</td>
<td>Bioethics</td>
<td>Lithuania</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>View Communication training</td>
<td>University of Szeged</td>
<td>Medicine</td>
<td>Specialization program</td>
<td>Medical ethics</td>
<td>Hungary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>View Contemporary Problems of Medical Ethics</td>
<td>Charles University in Prague</td>
<td>Other</td>
<td>Master program</td>
<td>Medical ethics</td>
<td>Czech Republic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>View Continuous Medical Education</td>
<td>University of Pecs</td>
<td>Medicine</td>
<td>Continuous education</td>
<td>Medical ethics</td>
<td>Hungary</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3. Advisory Expert Committee

- identifying a core curriculum in the area of ethics
- developing standards and criteria for evaluating teaching programmes
- providing a system of certification of programmes

Meetings:
July 2005; March 2006; June 2006
August 2006; July 2007

COMEST: Gracia, Apressyan
IBC: Evans, Guessous, de Castro
UNESCO Chairs: Carmi
WMA: Williams
TWAS: Balasubramanian

- draft proposal for core curriculum in bioethics
- development of supporting multimedia resources
4. Ethics teachers training course

Aims:

- Learning how to teach ethics
- Empowering a new generations of ethics teachers

Courses

- 30 October – 4 November 2006: Bucharest, Romania
  Cooperation with CEPES, UNESCO chair Haifa
- 9-13 July 2007: second course in Kenya for Africa
- September 2007: Bratislava
- November 2007: Riyadh
5. Educational resources

Ethics and policy

Ethics and healthcare

Ethics and public debate
Ethics Education Programme

- Mapping of experts
- Description of programs
  - Core curriculum proposals
    - Educational resources
      - Ethics teachers training courses
  - Network or “schools”
    - Documentation centers
      - UNESCO chairs
  - more and better ethics teaching programs
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Areas of ethics</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>animal ethics</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>bioethics</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dental ethics</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>engineering ethics</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>environmental ethics</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ethics and law</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ethics and social sciences</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>medical ethics</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>nursing ethics</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pharmacy ethics</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>philosophical ethics</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>science ethics</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Ethics teaching programmes (108)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Countries</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Albania</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belarus</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bulgaria</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Croatia</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Czech Republic</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hungary</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latvia</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lithuania</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poland</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Romania</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Russian Federation</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Serbia</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slovakia</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ukraine</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Ethics teaching programmes (108)

## Objectives of programmes

- awareness of normative dimension 90
- moral sensitivity 85
- good conduct 59
- identification of moral issues 100
- knowledge/information 103
- understanding/explaining 82
- analysis/reasoning 93
- justification/argumentation 75
- critical reflection 89
## Ethics teaching programmes (108)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of students enrolled</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>over 100</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>100 – 51</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50 – 21</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20 – 1</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Ethics teaching programmes (108)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Total number of teaching hours</th>
<th>Total number of student working hours</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• 1 – 20</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• 21 – 40</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• 41 – 100</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• 101 – 500</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• 501 – 1000</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• over 1000</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Ethics teaching programmes (108)

### Status of the programme

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Programme</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>mandatory</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>optional</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>choice from a mandatory list</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Mandatory study materials

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Study Materials</th>
<th>Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mandatory study materials</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Ethics teaching programmes (108)

UNESCO documents used in programs

• *Universal Declaration on the Human Genome and Human Rights*  51

• *International Declaration on Human Genetic Data*  19

• *Universal Declaration on Bioethics and Human Rights*  8
**Core course in bioethics**

- based on principles of Universal Declaration on Bioethics and Human Rights
- proposes a minimum program
- flexibility: does not impose a particular model
- global outreach: useful in all regions
- heterogeneity: variety and diversity around a common core
- aim: to facilitate the introduction of bioethics primarily in medical schools
Core course in bioethics

Consultation meeting July 4-5, 2007
- experts invited in cooperation with TWAS
- interdisciplinarity and cultural diversity
- english - french

What do we expect?

Feedback and suggestions in order to finalise the proposal
- is it useful from a global perspective?
- how can it be improved?

Meeting of Advisory Committee 5-6 July, 2007
Core course in bioethics

Implementation

- proposal generally available (languages)
- development of educational resources
  * multimedia (Benyakar team)
  * case books (UNESCO Chairs)
- test phase: introduction in interested medical schools in different regions followed by assessment and possible revision