United Nations
Educational, Scientific and
Cultural Organization

GUIDELINES FOR THE PREPARATION OF REPORTS BY MEMBER STATES ON THE APPLICATION OF THE RECOMMENDATION CONCERNING EDUCATION FOR INTERNATIONAL UNDERSTANDING, CO-OPERATION AND PEACE AND EDUCATION RELATING TO HUMAN RIGHTS AND FUNDAMENTAL FREEDOM (1974)

As adopted at the 199th session of the Executive Board

I. Introduction

A. About the 1974 Recommendation

1. The UNESCO Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Co-operation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms (1974 Recommendation) aims to promote world peace through international understanding, solidarity and cooperation. It was adopted on 19 November 1974 by the General Conference of UNESCO at its 18th session.

2. The General Conference "recommends that Member States should apply" the provisions included in the 1974 Recommendation "by taking whatever legislative or other steps" that provide institutional (e.g. policies and systems) and pedagogical (e.g. teacher training, educational materials, equipment, etc.) support for its implementation, based on the "objectives", referred to in paragraph 4 of the 1974 Recommendation, "regarded as major guiding principles" such as a global education perspective, cultural diversity, interdependence, communication, rights and responsibilities, international solidarity and cooperation, and, problem solving, as well as other principles[1] including:

    - cultural diversity and tolerance
    - equality and non-discrimination
    - peace and non-violence
    - justice and fairness
    - human rights and fundamental freedoms
    - human survival and well-being
    - caring for our planet/sustainability

3. The 1974 Recommendation is applicable to formal, non-formal and informal education and to all levels, from pre-primary to higher and adult education and life-long learning. It concerns areas such as civics and ethics education, education for international understanding, solidarity and cooperation and/or other related subjects, such as peace education, human rights education or other areas of study that focus or include the teaching and learning of the above principles. Over time, these areas have evolved to include other topics[2] related to education on sustainable development, climate change, global citizenship, preventing violent extremism, or others, which are also closely related to the original principles of the 1974 Recommendation.

[1] These are principles that are included throughout the 1974 Recommendation and which are grouped here to guide the reporting process.
[2] These include topics that are closely related to the principles of the 1974 Recommendation and which are frequently mainstreamed in national education systems. They are also used as a reference in the questionnaire.

B. Reporting obligations

4. The General Conference, at its 18th session, "recommends that Member States submit […] reports concerning the action taken by them in pursuance of this recommendation". Moreover, in accordance with Article VIII of UNESCO's Constitution "Each Member State shall submit to the Organization […] reports […] on the action taken upon the recommendations and conventions referred to in Article IV, paragraph 4."

5. All Member States, given the political commitment to and moral force of the 1974 Recommendation and their reporting obligations, should provide information on legislative measures that have been taken pursuant to the 1974 Recommendation and the ways in which national education policies and programmes correspond to its provisions. Information supplied by Member States should demonstrate how laws and practices comply with the commitments under the 1974 Recommendation, describing legal norms as well as actual implementation.

6. For the full text of the 1974 Recommendation please follow this link: http://portal.unesco.org/en/ev.php-URL_ID=13088&URL_DO=DO_TOPIC&URL_SECTION=201.html

II. How to fill in the questionnaire

- The following questionnaire has been updated to guide and assist Member States with their reporting. It aims to collect, in a simplified manner, information on the extent to which Member States have mainstreamed the principles of the 1974 Recommendation in their education systems, focusing on institutional, content, teachers, assessment, materials/resources, experiential opportunities and overall implementation issues. Responses to this questionnaire will be considered as the official national report for each Member State.

- Only one questionnaire per country should be submitted, which will represent the official country report.

- Member States with a federal system of governance are invited to provide information on the overall implementation of the 1974 Recommendation in the country rather than its implementation in each individual sub-national state, as appropriate. Space is also provided under question 29 for Member States to include any additional information they wish to share.

- Prior to completing the questionnaire, Member States are encouraged to organize necessary consultations within and outside the Ministry of Education/Government, including with key, relevant civil society partners to collect the information/data.

- Member States have two options for submitting the questionnaire:

  i. Online: the questionnaire can be completed and submitted online through this link;

  ii. Hard copy: the questionnaire can be completed electronically and the hard copy should be sent to the Assistant Director-General for Education, UNESCO. It is recommended that the questionnaire be filled by the Ministry responsible for education.

IV. Questionnaire

1. To what extent are the guiding principles of the 1974 Recommendation (e.g. cultural diversity and tolerance, equality and non-discrimination, peace and non-violence, justice, human rights and fundamental freedoms, human survival and well-being, caring for our planet/sustainability, etc.) reflected in your constitution or domestic legislation?

   Not at all ○ 1 ○ 2 ○ 3 ○ 4 ○ 5 Fully

2. To what extent are the principles of the 1974 Recommendation reflected in your country's current education policy/ies and frameworks?

   Not at all ○ 1 ○ 2 ○ 3 ○ 4 ○ 5 Fully

3. Please provide any additional information on the measures taken by your country to incorporate the principles of the 1974 Recommendation in constitutional, legal and policy frameworks.

   The constitution of Estonia declares human rights and human rights values as basic values of the Republic of Estonia. According to the Basic Schools and Upper Secondary Schools Act and national curriculum, human rights are considered basic values of Estonian education.

   Also according to the Education Act the fundamental principles of education are based on the recognition of universal and national values, freedom of the individual, religion and conscience.
   The objectives of education are to:
   1) create favorable conditions for the development of the individual, the family and the Estonian nation, also for ethnic minorities, and economic, political and cultural life in Estonian society and also nature conservation, within the context of the global economy and global culture;
   2) shape individuals who respect and abide by the law;
   3) create opportunities for everyone to engage in lifelong learning.

   Human rights and human rights education are also closely connected to the strategic goals of Estonian Lifelong Learning Strategy 2020, especially the changed approach to teaching and learning and equal opportunities in education, which both presume human rights and common values reflecting in both, lessons and school culture. Other strategic documents derive from the same principles – strong and cohesive society is a general goal of all different policy initiatives.

4. Has there been an increased emphasis on the principles of the 1974 Recommendation in an education/curriculum reform or policy development that took place in the last five years?

   ○ (a) Yes. Please specify below:

   In August 2014, the Government approved amendments to the national curricula of basic and upper secondary schools which *inter alia* enhanced the promotion of gender equality at these school levels, including in tuition of social subjects, career planning, technology and handicraft. The curriculum is competence and outcome-based and sets requirements for teaching and learning environment, emphasising *inter alia* the obligation of schools to

create and ensure an environment, where human rights are respected, no-one is discriminated and students are as much as possible involved in school governance.

In line with that, the prevention and tackling of school bullying has gained signified attention. In 2015 a concept of bullying-free education was adopted. The concept sets out priorities and activities implemented primarily by a 'bullying-free coalition' – a network of several NGOs and Ethics Centre of the University of Tartu active in the field.

Human rights education in connection with value education, media literacy and critical thinking is set as a target to be developed in the General Education Programme 2016-2019 (part of the Estonian Lifelong Learning Strategy 2020). According to the Programme, a concept of human rights education will be developed in 2017.

In 2009 the Estonian Ministry of Education and Research approved the national programme "Values Development in Estonian Society 2009–2013"; the programme was subsequently renewed for the years 2015-2020. The main goals in value development are:

- To encourage the discussion and formation of a shared understanding about the values the examination and application of which could enable us to address the burning issues in the Estonian society.
- To close the gap between the rhetorical declarations about values and the actual choices in the sphere of values so that our wishes concerning the development of society could become true.
- To enable the new generation to address the societal issues by helping young people to recognise and overcome the problematic attitudes in the sphere of values.
- To support the values education of children and adolescents in preschools and schools, so that each of them could develop in the educational environment that supports integral personal development, formation of a clear understanding of one's values and of the ability to cooperate successfully in society.
- To encourage the society as a whole to support preschools and schools so that all parties in the society would recognise and help to realise the possibilities for addressing societal issues that education can offer.

In relation to the current refugee crisis, several activities have been carried out by Estonian Refugee Council, Ethics Centre of Tartu University, NGO Mondo, NGO Ethical Links and others. To bring some examples, Ethics Centre has for example developed a migration and refugees related edition to the students' game "Discoverers of Values", NGO Mondo has also created a students' game on the same topic. A conference on multicultural school environments was held in autumn 2016. Both, Mondo and Ethical Links have created study material and organised teacher trainings and other events on different topics related to globalisation, multiculturalism, religion etc.

Additionally, the education for sustainable development (ESD) has gained in Estonia significant momentum with the support of EU Structural Funds. In the financial period from 2007–2013 two measures were supported: "Development of the infrastructure of environmental education" with 22.3 million euros by the European Regional Development Fund and "Development of Environmental Education" with 3.2 million euros by the European Union Social Fund.
Ministry of Education and Research and Ministry of Environment have supplied educators with the competence to include sustainable development in their everyday teaching. In 2011–2015 under the Development of Environmental Education program (supported by the European Social Fund) the public procurement "Preparation of in-service training curricula and training courses for teachers of formal education and universities and non-formal environmental education professionals" was launched in 2013. The objective of the program was to equip educators and teachers with the competences to implement active learning methods and integrate the cross-curriculum sustainable development topic in their everyday teaching. The two main state universities which provide initial teacher`s education prepared in-service programs and organised these ESD courses. A special in-service training curriculum for formal education teachers and non-formal education professionals was compiled.

- (b) No
- (c) No information available

5. If yes, please indicate the principles and topics on which there has been increased emphasis in the last five years. *(please tick all that apply)*

Peace and non-violence

- (a) Friendly relations among nations
- (b) Preventing violent extremism
- (c) Preventing other forms of violence including bullying, gender-based violence, school-related gender-based violence, etc.)

Human rights and fundamental freedoms

- (a) Equality, inclusion and non-discrimination
- (b) Justice and fairness
- (c) Ethics/ morals / values

Cultural diversity and tolerance

- (a) International understanding, solidarity and cooperation
- (b) Intercultural and interreligious dialogue

- (c) Global citizenship

Human survival and well being

- (a) Climate change
- (b) Environmental sustainability, caring for the planet
- (c) Sustainable development, consumption, and livelihood

- Other principles/topics. Please specify below:

6. Has there been any specific taskforce, working group, office or other mechanism set up in the last five years within the government to facilitate the implementation of the above mentioned principles/topics within education?

- (a) Yes. Please specify below (e.g. name, department, topic, tasks, etc.)

Estonia created the position of Ombudsman for Children on 19 March 2011. The duties of the Ombudsman are carried out by the Chancellor of Justice. The Children's Rights Department of the Office of the Chancellor of Justice performs the everyday functions of the Ombudsman.

In October 2013, Estonian government established the Gender Equality Council, set forth in the Gender Equality Act and functioning as an advisory body to the government. Its responsibilities are advising the Government in matters related to strategies for the promotion of gender equality, approving general objectives of gender equality policy and presenting opinions to the Government concerning the compliance of national programmes with the obligation of gender mainstreaming. Among the 22 members of the Council there are representatives of institutions and NGOs working with gender equality, universities and political parties. In March 2015, the Council submitted proposals to the Government to take measures to diminish negative gender-related stereotyping in society, to promote equal economic independence, to increase gender balance, to increase the quality of life and to promote effective implementation of gender mainstreaming.

At the beginning of 2015, preparations started to nominate the Gender Equality and Equal Treatment Commissioner for the independent monitoring mechanism pursuant to Article 33 of the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, including amendments in legislation and allocation of resources.

Both of the institutions also carry out education related activities and their work is highly relevant for both, the organisation and governance and content, of education.

- (b) No

- (c) No information available

7. Which of the following, or similar, principles and topics are taught in your formal educational system as part of the curriculum? *(please tick all that apply)*

Peace and non-violence

- (a) Friendly relations among nations
- (b) Preventing violent extremism
- (c) Preventing other forms of violence, including bullying, gender-based violence, school-related gender-based violence, etc.

Human rights and fundamental freedoms

- (a) Equality, inclusion and non-discrimination
- (b) Justice and fairness
- (c) Ethics/ morals / values

Cultural diversity and tolerance

- (a) International understanding, solidarity and cooperation
- (b) Intercultural and interreligious dialogue
- (c) Global citizenship

Human survival and well being

- (a) Climate change
- (b) Environmental sustainability, caring for the planet
- (c) Sustainable development, consumption, and livelihood

- Other principles/topics. Please specify below:

8. In which school subjects are these principles and topics mainly taught? *(please tick all that apply and number them in order of importance)*

- ☐ (a) Arts
- ☐ (b) Civics, civil or citizenship education
- ☐ (c) Ethics/moral studies

- [ ] (c) Geography
- [ ] (d) Health and Physical Education and Sports
- [ ] (e) History
- [ ] (f) Languages
- [ ] (g) Religious education
- [ ] (h) Science
- [ ] (i) Social studies
- [ ] (j) Other. Please specify below:

Here, the answer is based on concrete subject syllabuses, however, the principles and topics are actually cross-curricular. Schools shall build up a school culture respecting democratic and human right values. Within the learning process, human rights and other topics are connected with the core competences (for example value and cultural competence; social and civic competence; self-awareness competence; communication competence) and resembled in cross-curricular topics described in the general part of the national curriculum.

9. Please indicate the school levels at which these principles and/or topics are taught. *(please tick all that apply)*

- [ ] (a) Pre-primary
- [ ] (b) Primary
- [ ] (c) Secondary
- [ ] (d) Post-secondary/ Tertiary
- [ ] (e) Other. Please specify below (e.g. adult education, TVET, etc.):

10. Please indicate the implementation approaches applied to teach these principles and topics. (*please tick all that apply)*

- [ ] (a) Integrated approach (e.g. making connections across all disciplines, connecting the curriculum with learning experiences in the community and life outside school)
- [ ] (b) Cross-curriculum approach (e.g. principles and topics are taught across more than one discipline/subject of the curriculum)
- [ ] (c) Whole-school approach (e.g. integrating the principles and topics in the school ethos, management, curriculum, teacher training, teaching practices, learning environment)
- [ ] (d) As a separate subject. Please indicate the subjects below (e.g. civics education)

In the Estonian education system all the approaches are in use. The main and general ones are the first three (a-c). Point d – as a separate subject – usually finds its expression in different optional subjects, especially upper-secondary education courses. However, it is possible for the

schools to also organise the whole study process in their school around all or some of the principles and topics in question. As the national curriculum is outcome-based, the schools have a wide autonomy to organise their school curricula and study process.

As an accompanying material for the implementation of the national curricula, descriptions of study process have been worked out in Estonia. These descriptions are there for every subject and the aim of these is to assist teachers in integrating cross-curricular topics, core competencies and creating links between different subjects in the study process in their own subject. The descriptions of study process are currently being complemented with the topics of human rights, gender equality and communication competence.

11. Overall, are the number of teaching hours for the principles and topics mentioned earlier estimated to be sufficient?

Not at all ○ 1 ○ 2 ○ 3 ○ 4 ○ 5 Fully

12. To what extent are the principles and topics mentioned earlier reflected in the curriculum of pre-service teacher training?

Not at all ○ 1 ○ 2 ○ 3 ○ 4 ○ 5 Fully

13. Teachers for which level of education received training that reflects the principles and topics mentioned earlier? *(please tick all that apply)*

- ○ (a) Pre-primary
- ○ (b) Primary
- ○ (c) Secondary
- ○ (d) Post-secondary/ Tertiary
- ○ (e) Other. Please specify below (e.g. adult education, TVET, etc.):

The basis for the teacher training curricula are the professional standards of teachers and vocational education teachers that describe these competences.

14. Please indicate the overall percentage of teachers estimated to have been trained on these principles and topics through in-service training and teacher professional development.

- ○ (a) 0 - 20%
- ○ (b) 21 - 40%
- ○ (c) 41 - 60%
- ○ (d) 61 - 80%
- ○ (e) 81 - 100%

15. Are the principles and topics mentioned earlier included generally in student assessments/ examinations?

- ○ (a) Yes

- (b) No
- (c) No information available

If yes, please indicate which of the following dimensions of learning were included in the last student assessments/examination. *(please tick all that apply)*

- (a) Knowledge
- (b) Skills and competencies
- (c) Values and attitudes
- (d) Behaviours
- (e) None
- (f) No information available

16. Which of the following dimensions of learning is your country planning to reinforce in student assessment/examinations in the next five years, in relation to the principles and topics mentioned earlier? *(please tick all that apply)*

- (a) Knowledge
- (b) Skills and competencies
- (c) Values and attitudes
- (d) Behaviours
- (e) None
- (f) No information available

17. If the principles and topics mentioned earlier are not included in student assessments/ examinations, please indicate the main reasons (e.g. not a priority, lack of funds/expertise, etc.)

In our understanding regarding this principles and topics main effort should be placed on that how the student uses them in real situations. Therefore, the knowledge itself is less important than the behavioural skills.

18. To what extent are there adequate teaching and resource materials (including ICTs and audio-visual materials) to teach/deliver the principles below and engage learners? (*please tick all that apply)*

(a) Peace and non-violence	Not at all Adequately	1	2	3	4	5
(b) Human rights and fundamental freedoms	Not at all Adequately	1	2	3	4	5
(c) Cultural diversity and tolerance	Not at all	1	2	3	4	5

Adequately

(d) Human survival and well being

Not at all ○ 1 ○ 2 ○ 3 ○ 4 ○ 5 Adequately

(e) Other. Please specify below:

Not at all ○ 1 ○ 2 ○ 3 ○ 4 ○ 5 Adequately

19. Has a textbook revision been carried out in the last five years to reflect the principles and topics mentioned earlier?

○ a) Yes. Please specify (e.g. to include which principles and topics in which subject, level of education, etc.)

The textbooks and reviewed and re-published regularly. As the national curriculum, which – as described above – includes all these priciples, values and topics, is the basis for textbooks, the principles and values in question must also be included in the textbooks. Thus, according to a Regulation of the Minister of Education and Research, study literature must be based on the core values established in the national curriculum, whereas it must take into account the principle of multiculturalism and avoid stereotypes that incite gender based, nation based, religious, cultural or racial prejudice.

○ (b) No

○ (c) No information available

20. Please indicate which of the following pedagogical approaches/learning principles have been applied with relation to the implementation of the 1974 Recommendation. (*please tick all that apply)*

○ (a) Learner-centred

○ (b) Innovative and creative

○ (c) Participatory and interactive

○ (d) Whole school

○ (e) Research and experimentation

○ (f) Education through arts and sports

○ (g) Child friendly schools

○ (h) Other. Please specify below:

21. What kind of programmes and practices are implemented that allow students to experience other cultures and interact with people of different backgrounds (e.g. culture, ethnicity, religion)? *(please tick all that apply)*

○ (a) Student exchange programmes

- (b) Twinning with other education institutions (regional/international level)
- (c) Linking schools/classrooms with those in another country through internet/social media
- (d) Collaborative projects
- (e) Community work/ participation in community/local activities/events
- (f) Other. Please specify blow:

22. Has there been an increase in the number of these programmes and practices, implemented in the last five years?

- a) Yes. Please specify (e.g. new pedagogy/ies introduced, in which subject, cross-curriculum themes/projects, etc.)

  As mentioned, the changed approach to teaching and learning (student-centred approach) is one of the five strategic goals of Estonian Lifelong Learning Strategy. The Ministry of Education has launched an initiative Interesting School, that promotes good innovative practices implementing the changed approach and provides a communication platform for different stakeholders in the field of education. With each year the understanding and amount of good practices in regard to the changed approach to teaching and learning increases. Thus, as mentioned above, the refugee crisis has brought these principles and topics into the spotlight. Therefor also a number of activities and attention on these topics have increased.
- (b) No
- (c) No information available

23. What opportunities are provided at school level for students to participate in decision-making processes that concern them? *(please tick all that apply)*

- (a) School governance/decision making
- (b) Student council or similar bodies
- (c) Student clubs
- (d) None
- (e) Other. Please specify below:

24. Please indicate whether the principles and topics mentioned earlier are reflected in programmes provided outside the school system. *(please tick all that apply)*

- (a) Non-formal education
- (b) Informal education
- (c) Adult education
- (d) Media-based education

- (e) No information available
- (f) Additional information:

The principles are reflected in youth work. As it is the creation of conditions to promote the diverse development of young persons which enable them to be active outside their families, formal education acquired within the adult education system, and work on the basis of their free will. The organisation of youth work proceeds from the following principles:
1) youth work is performed for the benefit of and together with young people by involving them in the decision making process;
2) upon creating the conditions for the acquisition of knowledge and skills the needs and interests of young people shall be proceeded from;
3) youth work is based on the participation and free will of young people;
4) youth work supports the initiative of young people;
5) youth work proceeds from the principle of equal treatment, tolerance and partnership.

25. How would the current overall implementation of the principles 1974 Recommendation be rated?

Not yet implemented ○ 1 ○ 2 ○ 3 ○ 4 ○ 5 Fully implemented

26. Compared to five years ago, how would the current status of the implementation of the 1974 Recommendation be rated?

Not improved ○ 1 ○ 2 ○ 3 ○ 4 ○ 5 Improved

27. If there has been little or no progress with relation to the implementation of the 1974 Recommendation, what have been the major obstacles? *(please tick all that apply)*

- (a) No political/policy priority
- (b) Lack of education/curriculum/pedagogical initiatives
- (c) Insufficient resources (financial, technical, human)
- (d) Competing demands
- (e) Other and/or additional comments on your choice:

28. If progress has been made, what have been the enabling factors? *(please tick all that apply)*

- (a) Political/policy priority
- (b) Education/curriculum/pedagogical initiatives implemented
- (c) Increased demand (by parents, the community, policymakers, etc.)
- (d) Availability of resources (financial, technical, human)
- (e) Other and/or additional comments on your choice:

29. Please enter below any other information on the country's implementation of the 1974 Recommendation that you would like to report on. You may provide additional information on any question or include any other issue that has not been covered by this questionnaire.

Human rights are also considered in the curriculum of the Estonian Academy of Security Sciences (EASS). EASS provides internal security education at three levels (vocational, applied higher and masters education) for police, prison, rescue, taxation and customs services. Lifelong learning services are provided for all target-groups. Human rights have a special attention in police and corrections (prison service) curricula.

In August 2015 Regional Summer Academy for the Baltics organised in co-operation with the Council of Europe, the European Wergeland Centre, the Estonian Ministry of Education and the Estonian Institute for Human Rights took place in Tallinn. Adapted to national and regional priorities, the Academy combines a school-wide approach to human rights education/education for democratic citizenship and history learning. Sharing a common past, the three countries will benefit from a programme that helps their multicultural societies create spaces for dialogue and reinforce a culture of co-operation. The Academy from there on takes place annually rotating in one of the three Baltic countries.

Thank you for your kind collaboration!